**Presentation to REMI users** 

# **Energy-Related Policy Modeling**

Energy-related policy variables and underlying data in the REMI model



Tuesday, January 25, 2021



# Disclaimer

The views in this presentation do not reflect the views of FTI Consulting. The analysis contained in this presentation are for illustrative purposes only and are subject to uncertainty.

# Overview





# FTI Consulting | Overview

FTI Consulting ("FTI") is an independent global business advisory firm dedicated to helping organizations manage change, mitigate risk, and resolve disputes. Due to our unique mix of EXPERTISE, CULTURE, BREADTH OF SERVICES, and INDUSTRY EXPERIENCE, we have a tangible impact on our clients' most complex opportunities and challenges.





# Economic Impacts Group ("EIG") | Overview

**EIG** is a functional group within FTI Consulting that answers "What If?" questions about the economy and public policy. We prefer to use third-party, documented models, not proprietary tools.

## ECONOMIC IMPACTS GROUP OVERVIEW

- EIG examines how the wider economy and markets react to changes in public policy:
  - Economy employment, business sales, gross product, household income, government tax revenues, demographics, and cost of living
  - Markets impacts to supply, demand, prices, profitability, and rates of growth
- Our deliverables formulate clients' strategic plans and educate stakeholders, including policymakers, regulators, the media, and the public

## MARKET AND ECONOMIC IMPACT MODELS



 Input-output model showing linkages across 550+ sectors including households and governments down to the zip code level.



 Long-term computable general equilibrium (CGE) model of demand and supply for labor and commodities as well as demographics.



 Commodity and sectoral CGE model of production, consumption, and international trade and financial transactions.

#### **ISSUE AND SECTORAL COVERAGE**



- Agriculture and Resources
- Banking and Finance



Demographics



- Energy and the Environment
- Fiscal Policy
- Healthcare



Insurance and Pensions



- Manufacturing

 $\frac{1}{2}$ 

- Retail and Wholesale
- Transportation and Infrastructure



# Energy Markets Advisory Team | Overview

The Energy Market Advisory team is part of FTI's Energy, Power & Products group, providing the analytical insights required to make the right strategic decisions in business planning, disputes, policy design, and transactions.

## **OVERVIEW**

- Team with extensive biofuels, electricity, coal, oil & gas, renewables, and emissions expertise
- Clients range from law firms, trade associations and think tanks to merchants, utilities, shippers, and renewables offtakers
- Deliverables often are data intensive and include an expert report, market report, or presentation
- Recent projects include:
  - Economic harm if a pipeline were to cease operation
  - U.S. market landscape study for biomass with carbon capture
  - White paper on the closure of two coal-fired plants in NJ
  - Independent market report for a wind farm sale in SPP

#### **SERVICES PROVIDED**

Business Strategy Emissions Forecasting Energy Policy Studies Expert Testimony Market Landscape Studies Monte Carlo Modeling Price Forecasting Resource Planning

## **ENERGY MARKET MODELS**



- Unit generation, emissions, additions, and retirements
- Zonal energy, REC, and capacity prices
- Zonal transmission/ interchange flows
- Coal basin production, transport, and prices



**Global Gas & LNG** 

- Represents more than 20 supply countries
- Includes more than 20 demand regions / countries
- Accounts for long-term contracts
- Simulates monthly LNG trade and prices



- Cloud-based, nodal security-constrained economic dispatch model
- Simulates day-ahead and real-time nodal, hub, and zonal prices and transmission flows

#### **Revenue Due Diligence**

- Scope 1, 2, and 3 Accounting / Strategy
- **Stochastic Modeling**
- **Supply and Demand Forecasting**

# Presentation





# **REMI Model Structure**

REMI is a dynamic, computable general equilibrium ("CGE") model of regional economies. The outputs of the PLEXOS<sup>®</sup> modeling became input variables for the REMI model simulations.





# Policy Variables Most Relevant to Energy

## Block 1 – Output and Demand

- Exogenous final demand
- Detailed industry sales
- Detailed farm output

## Block 2 – Labor and Capital Demand

Industry employment

## Block 3 – Population and Labor Supply

- Nonpecuniary amenity aspects

## Block 4 – Compensation, Prices, and Costs

- <u>Responding to price changes</u>
  - Consumer prices
  - Fuel costs
- <u>Responding to preference changes</u>
  - Consumer spending
  - Consumption reallocation



# **Economic Sectors Most Relevant to Energy**

## Mining

## — Coal mining

- Oil and natural gas extraction
- Metals mining
- Nonmetallic minerals mining

## Utilities

- Electric power
- Natural gas
- Water and wastewater

## Construction

## Manufacturing

Transportation and Warehousing

## Farm



# PLEXOS<sup>®</sup> Model Zonal Map





## **MISO Market Overview**

## **Modeled Hubs and Load Zones**



MISO consists of 10 load zones with a large seam across 36 local balancing authorities.

#### Market Overview – 2022 Snapshot





# **Regional Disparities Drive Resource Challenges Across Markets**

Non-CAISO

WECC

tightening reserve margin

value and profitability

CAISO

#### SPP

- High reserve margin (~33%) contributes to reliability but exerts downward pressure on prices
- New Western Energy Imbalance Services ("WEIS") enhances services along the seam between the eastern and western interconnects.
- High reliance on fossil resources
- Growth in wind resources expected

#### WECC

- Deepening duck curve calls for resources with flexible ramping capability
- Risk of operating reserve shortfalls in CAISO
- Aliso Canyon curtailment impacts CAISO and WECC
- Expanding EIM improves renewable integration, grid reliability and economic benefits
- CA, NV and NM's increased RPS goals impact resource investments

#### MISO

- Weak capacity construct with vertical demand curve
- Low energy prices accelerate retirement of uneconomic units
- Renewable (wind and solar) continue to dominate new builds
- Major transmission projects designed to access renewables
- Reserve margin likely to decrease with resource retirements and export capacity to PJM 1

MISO

MISO

SPP

ERCOT

ERCOT

Post-Uri market reform to address reliability and resiliency

Coal plants closures herald resource adequacy issues with

Absent of a capacity market, Operating Reserve Demand

Co-locating storage, solar PV and wind to enhance grid

Deregulated electricity market with high liquidity

Curve (ORDC) is vital in supporting new builds

NYIS

PJM

SERC

#### NYISO/ ISONE

- Natural gas infrastructure constraints and fuel-security risk is a pressing concern
- Pay-for-Performance market
  design in ISONE provides incentives for capacity
- High reserve margin (~30% ISONE; ~22% NYISO)
- High growth in distributed PV
- Unsustainable high-capacity factors in NYISO peaking units.
- High renewable standards have long term market impacts

#### PJM

- Long-term load growth under 0.7% per year
- Large scale coal retirements
- Abundant gas driving aggressive combined cycle builds in Marcellus/Utica
- Measured renewables development; offshore wind likely by mid decade
- Robust capacity market but uncertain future



# Renewable Portfolio Standard ("RPS")





# Integrating PLEXOS<sup>®</sup> Outputs into REM



Economic benefits for regions with additional renewable investments, such as wind-heavy midwestern or solar-heavy southwestern states

RPS would change generation by technology type, influencing demand for fossil fuel extraction activities

The federal government pays roughly \$18 per MWh for wind generation, which would likely increase under a RPS and increase these costs

The increase in low- and zero-cost dispatch technology (e.g., wind and solar) would reduce energy costs, though ACPs and other costs would offset this (or more) in some regions of the country in most years







# Scott Nystrom Senior Director FTI Consulting (515) 290-6990

Scott.Nystrom@FTIConsulting.com

# **Experts with Impact**<sup>™</sup>

